

Travaux du 19ème CIL | 19th ICL papers

Congrès International des Linguistes, Genève 20-27 Juillet 2013
International Congress of Linguists, Geneva 20-27 July 2013



Isabelle CHARNAVEL

Harvard University, USA
icharnavel@fas.harvard.edu

Same, different, other in French: the same analysis for all different constructions

poster presentation in session: 5 Theoretical and comparative syntax (Luigi Rizzi)

Published and distributed by: Département de Linguistique de l'Université de Genève, Rue de Candolle 2, CH-1205 Genève, Switzerland
Editor: Département de Linguistique de l'Université de Genève, Switzerland
ISBN: 978-2-8399-1580-9



Same, different, other in French: the same analysis for all different constructions

GOAL: provide a uniform, non-specific analysis for all constructions involving adjectives like *same*, *different* or *other* in French

MOTIVATION: not only theoretical economy, but also crosslinguistic evidence showing a unique term for *same* through all constructions in many unrelated languages.

MAIN POINTS OF THE ANALYSIS:

- *Same*, *different* and *other* are complemented by DPs (like relational terms) or by comparative clauses (like comparatives).
- The diversity of the constructions derives from the presence of silent structures: the complement can include a silent underspecified pronoun; the comparative clause can be elided.

The main focus in the literature: covert comparison Sentence-external vs. sentence-internal readings

(a.o. Carlson 1987, Moltmann 1992, Barker 2007, Brasoveanu 2011)

External: A. (You saw Stalker.) I saw a different movie.

Internal: B. Each critic saw a different movie.

C. The critics saw different movies.

Present strategy: relate covert to overt comparison

D. I saw a movie different from this one.

E. I saw a different movie than you did.

DIFFERENT [[différent]] = $\lambda x.\lambda y. x \neq y$

- (1) Lucie est différente de Claire. *Lucie is different from Claire.*

CASE 1: DIFFERENT FROM DP

- (2) J'ai vu un film différent de ce film-là.
I watched a movie different from this one.
- (3) Paul a vu un film différent de ce que proposait Marie.
Paul watched a movie different from what Marie proposed.

CASE 2: DIFFERENT FROM DP

Différent can be complemented by a silent, underspecified DP. Plural *différent* (e.g. 6-8): as many possible interpretations as pragmatically available covers (cf. Beck 2000).

- (4) Lucie a vu Frida hier. Moi, j'ai vu un film différent.
Lucie watched Frida yesterday. I watched a different movie from DP.
- (5) [Watching a trailer] C'est un film différent que j'avais vu.
It is a different movie from DP that I had watched.
- (6) Ces films sont différents. *These movies are different from DP.*
- (7) J'ai vu des films différents pendant les vacances.
I watched different movies from DP during the holidays.
- (8) Les critiques ont vu des films différents.
The critics watched different movies from DP.
- (9) Par rapport à la semaine dernière, chaque enfant est différent aujourd'hui. *As compared to last week, each child is different from DP today.*

CASE 3: DIFFERENT THAN [CP...DP...]

Différent can be complemented by a partially elided comparative clause, which denotes an individual (cf. free relative).

- (10) Paul a vu un film différent de Marie.
Paul watched a different movie than [CP ~~wh movie~~ Marie ~~watched wh movie~~].
- (11) J'ai regardé un film différent d'hier.
I watched a different movie than [CP ~~wh movie~~ I watched ~~wh movie~~ yesterday].

CASE 4: DIFFERENT THAN [CP...DP...]

Différent can be complemented by a fully elided comparative clause including a silent, underspecified DP.

- (12) Chaque critique a vu un film différent.
Each critic watched a different movie than [CP ~~wh movie~~ DP ~~watched wh movie~~].
- (13) Paul et Claire ont vu un film différent.
Paul and Claire watched a different movie than [CP ~~wh movie~~ DP ~~watched wh movie~~].

Specific issues with *autre* ('other') and *même* ('same')

Autre and *même* behave like *différent* except that:

- *AUTRE* does not have a symmetrical meaning (cf. ordering in time), thus does not license reciprocal interpretations (like comparatives).
- (14) Chaque *(nouveau) critique commente un autre (/un meilleur) film.
*Each *(new) critic comments another (/a better) movie.*
- *MEME* preferably induces a token reading and has a specific behavior with respect to its determiner and definiteness.
- (15) Ces deux robes sont *(les) mêmes. *These two dresses are *(the) same.*

Underspecification hypothesis (cases 2 and 4)

The complement of *différent/même/autre* can include a silent, underspecified DP that can be pragmatically interpreted as an anaphoric or deictic pronoun, a reflexive, a reciprocal or more vaguely.

This is independently attested with other elements:

- (16) Lucie est allée visiter Orléans hier. J'ai visité une ville voisine/plus belle.
Lucie visited Orléans yesterday. I visited a neighboring [it]/nicer [than it] town.
- (17) Le ciel est identique/plus beau aujourd'hui.
The sky is identical [to itself]/nicer [than itself] today.
- (18) J'ai visité des villes voisines. I visited neighboring [each other] cities.
- (19) Les enfants se regardent. *The children are looking at each other/themselves.*
- (20) Paul et Luc ont dit qu'ils étaient malades. P. and L. said that they were sick.
- (21) Chacun espère qu'ils iront à son enterrement.
Each one hopes that they will come to his funeral.

Argument for silent clause: island sensitivity (cases 3 and 4)

- Licensor in island

- (22) #Une personne différente est en colère parce qu'Anne a vaincu chaque joueur.

A different person is angry because Anne beat every player.

Intended interpretation: for each player that Anne beat, there is a different person who is angry.

- (23) *A more important person is angry because Sue beat Max than Mary.

Explanation: island violation by the movement required for the identity condition of the ellipsis to be fulfilled (and for scope reasons in 22).

- *Différent* in island

- (24) #Chaque joueur est en colère parce qu'Anne a vaincu une personne différente.

Every player is angry because Anne beat a different person.

Intended interpretation: for each player x, there is a person y such that x is angry because Anne beat y.

- (25) #Max is angry because Sue beat a better player than Mary.

Explanation: two island violations: 1- by the movement required for the resolution of Antecedent Containment; 2- by the *wh*-movement of the DP with *différent/degree* term in the elided comparative clause.

Distributivity of the licensor for singular *différent* (case 4)

The singular indefinite must be outscoped by a quantificational or partitioned plural DP to be distributively interpreted.

- (26) a. Un critique (différent) a vu chaque film. *A (different) critic watched each movie.*
b. #Un critique (différent) a vu plus de trois films.
#A (different) critic watched more than three movies.
- (27) a. Tous les critiques/Paul et Claire/les trois critiques ont vu un film (différent).
All the critics/Paul and Claire/the three critics watched a (different) movie.
b. ?Les critiques ont vu un film (différent). *The critics watched a (different) movie.*
c. #La classe/Luc a vu un film (différent). *The class/Luc watched a (different) movie.*

Further issue: silent pronoun in the time domain?

- (28) Le film s'arrête à chaque fois/toujours sur une image différente.
The movie stops every time/always on a different picture [than other times].

References

- Barker, Chris, 2007. 'Parasitic Scope'. *Linguistics and Philosophy* 30, 407-444.
- Beck, Sigrid, 2000. 'The Semantics of different: Comparison Operator and Relational Adjective'. *Linguistics and Philosophy* 23, 101-139.
- Brasoveanu, Adrian, 2011. 'Sentence-internal different as Quantifier-internal Anaphora'. *Linguistics and Philosophy* 34, 93-168.
- Carlson, Greg, 1987. *Same and Different: some Consequences for Syntax and Semantics*. *Linguistics and Philosophy* 10, 531-565.
- Moltmann, Friederike, 1992. 'Reciprocals and same/different: towards a Semantic Analysis'. *Linguistics and Philosophy* 15, 411-462.